| **Student Name:** Karin Yeung |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house would abolish all locked facilities (such as jails, detention centres and correctional facilities) for youth offenders |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow) | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for a child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 5 to 6 minutes’ long!]  Nice job reframing who these youth offenders are, and plenty of them deserve to be locked away.  On the counter set-up:   * Well done clarifying that you prefer locked facilities for a specific group of dangerous offenders, rather than supporting them for all. * We need to clarify what TYPES of youth offenders will go to locked centers in your world, and which will receive lighter punishments. * What is your burden/winning pathway?   Excellent first rebuttal that a minority of people incarcerated doesn’t prove that there’s a low scale of harms.   * On the last resort option, can we actually explain what are the harms that society is being exposed to if we do not incarcerate dangerous youth offenders?   + Conclude clearly that even if we spent millions of dollars in this, spending money on social safety and order is money well spent.   There’s an underlying assumption that we’re not proving, which is why Prop's alternatives are innately ineffective.   * Explain why you believe rehabilitation is so flawed and difficult to judge, so we have to err on the side of caution.   + We mentioned at the end of our speech on how easy it is to override Prop’s punishments and many do not feel any remorse! All of that analysis belongs here, instead of attached to an argument with a completely different premise.   On the first argument:   * The argument mixes two different premises on justness of the punishment as well as social safety, focusing on one premise at a time. * On social safety, well done mechanising the ways in which they are harmed.   + But we skipped over all of the impact analysis!   + Tie back all of the harms to the overall role of the criminal justice system and why sicial safety must be prioritised over all else.   Good response to the POI, clarify that youth offenders do in fact include teenagers.  On the second argument:   * Good claim on victims deserve to see their perpetrators locked up.   + But we’re not actually explaining what is your concept of justice here. Explain that punishments must be proportional to the crime.     - Explain the harm suffered by victims when they see their perpetrators get away with crime.     - Conclude that society will refuse to reintegrate all of them because they have not faced justice. * We ended up analysing social safety all over again! * The tangent on the failures of the alternatives does not belong in this argument either, this could be a rebuttal instead.   Please offer more POIs as well!  Well done with the conclusion.  7.12 - Watch for time! | | | | | | |